



## Early Journal Content on JSTOR, Free to Anyone in the World

This article is one of nearly 500,000 scholarly works digitized and made freely available to everyone in the world by JSTOR.

Known as the Early Journal Content, this set of works include research articles, news, letters, and other writings published in more than 200 of the oldest leading academic journals. The works date from the mid-seventeenth to the early twentieth centuries.

We encourage people to read and share the Early Journal Content openly and to tell others that this resource exists. People may post this content online or redistribute in any way for non-commercial purposes.

Read more about Early Journal Content at <http://about.jstor.org/participate-jstor/individuals/early-journal-content>.

JSTOR is a digital library of academic journals, books, and primary source objects. JSTOR helps people discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content through a powerful research and teaching platform, and preserves this content for future generations. JSTOR is part of ITHAKA, a not-for-profit organization that also includes Ithaka S+R and Portico. For more information about JSTOR, please contact [support@jstor.org](mailto:support@jstor.org).

AMERICAN ECONOMIC ASSOCIATION

QUARTERLY

Formerly published under the title of PUBLICATIONS OF THE AMERICAN ECONOMIC ASSOCIATION

---

THIRD SERIES.

VOL. X, NO. 1.

ISSUED QUARTERLY.

PRICE, \$4.00 PER YEAR

---

# PAPERS AND DISCUSSIONS

OF THE

## TWENTY-FIRST ANNUAL MEETING

ATLANTIC CITY, N. J.

DECEMBER 28-31, 1908

---

APRIL 1909

---

PUBLISHED BY THE  
AMERICAN ECONOMIC ASSOCIATION

PRINCETON, N. J.

LONDON: SWAN SONNENSCHN & CO.

---

Entered as second class matter May 5, 1908, at the post office at Princeton, N. J.,  
under the Act of Congress of July 16, 1894.

---

PRICE, IN PAPER, \$1.50; IN CLOTH \$2.00

# AMERICAN ECONOMIC ASSOCIATION

Organized at Saratoga, September 9, 1885.

---

## EX-PRESIDENTS

\*FRANCIS A. WALKER  
Massachusetts Institute of Technology.

\*CHARLES F. DUNBAR,  
Harvard University.

JOHN B. CLARK,  
Columbia University.

HENRY C. ADAMS,  
University of Michigan.

ARTHUR T. HADLEY,  
Yale University.

RICHARD T. ELY,  
University of Wisconsin.

EDWIN R. A. SELIGMAN,  
Columbia University.

FRANK W. TAUSSIG,  
Harvard University.

JEREMIAH W. JENKS,  
Cornell University.

SIMON N. PATTEN,  
University of Pennsylvania.

---

## OFFICERS FOR THE YEAR 1909

### *President*

DAVIS R. DEWEY,  
Mass. Inst. of Technology.

### *Vice-Presidents*

WILLARD FISHER,  
Yale University.

FABIAN FRANKLIN,  
Baltimore, Md.

FREDERICK B. HAWLEY,  
New York City.

### *Secretary and Treasurer*

T. N. CARVER  
Harvard University, Cambridge, Mass.

### *Publication Committee*

JACOB H. HOLLANDER, Chairman,  
Johns Hopkins University, Baltimore, Md.

CHARLES J. BULLOCK,  
Harvard University.

JAMES W. CROOK,  
Amherst College.

C. W. MIXTER,  
University of Vermont.

DAVID KINLEY,  
University of Illinois.

WILLIAM A. SCOTT,  
University of Wisconsin.

### *Editor of the Economic Bulletin*

E. W. KEMMERER,  
Cornell University, Ithaca, N. Y.

### *Executive Committee*

#### *Ex-Officio Members—*

THE PRESIDENT  
THE EX-PRESIDENTS  
THE VICE-PRESIDENTS  
THE SECRETARY-TREASURER  
THE CHAIRMAN PUBL. COM.

#### *Elected Members—*

FRANK H. DIXON, Dartmouth College  
HENRY C. EMERY, Yale University  
FRANK A. FETTER, Cornell University  
JOHN H. GRAY, University of Minnesota  
T. S. ADAMS, University of Wisconsin  
HENRY R. SEAGER, Columbia University

Inquiries and other communications regarding membership, meetings, and the general affairs of the Association, as well as orders for publications, should be addressed to the *Secretary of the American Economic Association*, Cambridge, Mass.

\*Deceased.

AMERICAN ECONOMIC ASSOCIATION  
QUARTERLY

Formerly published under the title of PUBLICATIONS OF THE AMERICAN ECONOMIC ASSOCIATION

---

THIRD SERIES.  
VOL. X, No. 1.

ISSUED QUARTERLY.  
PRICE, \$4.00 PER YEAR

---

PAPERS AND DISCUSSIONS

OF THE

TWENTY-FIRST ANNUAL  
MEETING

ATLANTIC CITY, N. J.

DECEMBER 28-31, 1908

---

APRIL 1909

---

PUBLISHED BY THE  
AMERICAN ECONOMIC ASSOCIATION  
PRINCETON, N. J.  
LONDON: SWAN SONNENSCHN & CO.

Copyright, 1909, by  
AMERICAN ECONOMIC ASSOCIATION

Printed by  
PRINCETON UNIVERSITY PRESS

# TABLE OF CONTENTS.

PAPERS AND DISCUSSIONS:	PAGE
The Making of Economic Literature—Presidential Address by S. N. Patten.....	I
Discussion on Making of Economic Literature:	
J. E. Hagerty.....	15
F. B. Hawley.....	18
T. N. Carver.....	21
Scott Nearing.....	22
E. T. Devine.....	22
The Theory of Collective Bargaining, by J. B. Clark.....	24
Discussion on the Theory of Collective Bargaining:	
A. C. Miller.....	40
G. E. Barnett.....	45
T. S. Adams.....	50
C. W. Doten.....	55
Round Table on Accounting.....	59
W. M. Cole.....	59
Accounting in its Relation to Economics, by Maurice H. Robinson. ....	62
A Definition of Accounting, by J. C. Duncan.....	75
The Present Position and Probable Development of Ac- countancy as a Profession.....	85
Discussion of Accountancy as a Profession:	
B. M. Rastall.....	97
A. M. Sakolski.....	98
Leon Brummer .....	100
O. M. W. Sprague.....	102
Simon Litman.....	102
Fundamental Distinctions in Labor Legislation, by H. W. Farnam .....	105
The American Way of Distributing Industrial Accident Losses, by Miss Crystal Eastman.....	119
What Form of Accident Insurance Should Our States Adopt? by M. O. Lorenz.....	135
Discussion on Workingmen's Accident Insurance:	
F. L. Hoffman.....	152
C. R. Henderson.....	155
Lee K. Frankel.....	156
John Martin .....	157
The Canadian Industrial Disputes Act, by A. Shortt....	158
Discussion of the Canadian Industrial Disputes Act:	
O. D. Skelton.....	174
Victor S. Clark.....	177
The Influence of Income on the Standards of Life, by R. C. Chapin .....	180

The Family in a Typical Mill Town, by Margaret F. Byington .....	193
Results of the Pittsburgh Survey, by Edward T. Devine..	207
Are Modern Industry and City Life Unfavorable to the Family? by Charles R. Henderson.....	217
Rural Life and the Family, by Kenyon L. Butterfield....	233
Discussion of Modern Industry and City Life:	
Paul U. Kellogg.....	239
Economic Geography: An attempt to state what it is and what it is not, by Edward Van Dyke Robinson.....	247
Coöperation in the Marketing of Agricultural Produce, by John Lee Coulter.....	258
Discussion on Agricultural Economics:	
J. B. Morman.....	266
T. N. Carver.....	273
Water Transportation in this Country—Round Table:	
F. H. Dixon.....	275
Factors Affecting the Future of Water Transportation in the United States, by Emory R. Johnson.....	277
Discussion of the Future of Water Transportation:	
C. J. Bullock.....	284
Stuart Daggett .....	285
The Best Way to Work for Tariff Revision, by H. C. Emery .....	287
Dual Tariff Systems, by N. I. Stone.....	301
Tariff Revision and Foreign Markets, by Simon Litman..	314
Discussion on Tariff Revision:	
C. W. Mixter.....	326
J. W. Crook.....	330
U. G. Weatherly .....	333
Central Bank of the United States, by P. M. Warburg....	338
Central Banks, by O. M. W. Sprague.....	359
Discussion on a Central Bank:	
Horace White.....	370
The Work of the National Monetary Commission, by A. Piatt Andrew.....	377
Control of the Capitalization of Public Service Corporations in Massachusetts, by C. J. Bullock.....	384
Discussion on the Control of Public Service Corporations in Massachusetts:	
F. J. Swayze.....	414
Milo R. Maltbie.....	417
E. D. Durand.....	421
W. Z. Ripley.....	423
R. T. Ely.....	423
Edward W. Bemis.....	425
C. J. Bullock.....	427
Index .....	431